

**MATANUSKA-SUSITNA BOROUGH
LIBRARY CITIZENS' ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

Chairman—Chad Scott (MBR 7)

Vice Chair—Michelle Dempsey (MBR 2)

MBR1—Nancy Bertels

MBR3—Aaron Malone

MBR4—Dorothy Denison

MBR5—Erik Palin

MBR6—Susan Hillman

ALT1—Camilla (Nan) Potts

ALT2—Sally Pollen



AGENDA

ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS AND LIVE STREAMED

<https://vimeo.com/showcase/11289539>

350 EAST DAHLIA AVENUE, PALMER

REGULAR MEETING

5:00 PM

September 9, 2024

I. CALL TO ORDER

II. ROLL CALL

III. AGENDA APPROVAL

IV. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

V. MINUTES OF PRECEDING MEETING

A. AUGUST 10, 2024

VI. STAFF REPORTS

A. Hugh Leslie – Recreation & Library Services Manager

VII. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION – (2 Minutes Per Person)

VIII. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

A. Materials Submitted for Reconsideration

1. Red Hood; Elana K. Arnold ISBN 978-0062742353

IX. NEW BUSINESS

A. Materials Submitted for Reconsideration

- | | |
|------------------------------|------------------------|
| 1. Damsel; Elana K. Arnold | ISBN 978-0-06-274232-2 |
| 2. Forever; Judy Blume | ISBN 978-1-4814-1442-5 |
| 3. The Haters; Jesse Andrews | ISBN 978-1-4197-2018-9 |

X. NEXT MEETING

A. OCTOBER 14, 2024

XI. MEMBERS, STAFF COMMENTS

XII. ADJOURNMENT

**MATANUSKA-SUSITNA BOROUGH
LIBRARY CITIZENS' ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

Chairman—Chad Scott (MBR 7)

Vice Chair—Michelle Dempsey (MBR 2)

MBR1—Nancy Bertels

MBR3—Aaron Malone

MBR4—Dorothy Denison

MBR5—Erik Palin

MBR6—Susan Hillman

ALT1— Camilla (Nan) Potts

ALT2— Sally Pollen



MEETING MINUTES

ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS AND LIVE STREAMED

<https://vimeo.com/showcase/11289539>

350 EAST DAHLIA AVENUE, PALMER

REGULAR MEETING

5:00 PM

AUGUST 12, 2024

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. Called to order at 5:00 pm

II. ROLL CALL

A. Present – Chad Scott, Michelle Dempsey, Nancy Bertels, Aaron Malone, Dorothy Denison, Susan Hillman, Sally Pollen (voting alternate)

B. Absent – Erik Palin, Camilla Potts

III. AGENDA APPROVAL

A. Agenda approved unanimously.

IV. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

A. Mr. Malone led the Pledge of Allegiance.

V. MINUTES OF PRECEDING MEETING

A. JULY 8TH, 2024 – Ms. Denison moved to approve minutes, unanimous consent.

VI. STAFF REPORTS

A. Hugh Leslie – Recreation & Library Services Manager

1. Mr. Leslie explained that he and Sarah Thomas will collect the score cards after the meeting to present to the Community Development Director. Introduced Sarah Thomas, Nick Spiropoulos and Erin Dooling as staff present at the meeting. Mr. Leslie stated 2 of the 4 books from the reconsideration list are available today, Damsel and Red Hood, if they decide to review one of those. If not, time to acquire the title they choose would be necessary.

VII. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION – (2 Minutes Per Person)

- A. Mary Robinson – Ms. Robinson hoped the committee has read the book, spoke to the difference of misinformation vs disinformation.
- B. Patricia Fisher – Ms. Fisher wanted to also make sure that each of the committee members have read the book before voting.
- C. Jackie Goforth – Ms. Goforth identified herself as the challenger of the book that committee is voting on this meeting. Explained why she submitted the book for reconsideration.
- D. Karen Lewis – Ms. Lewis thanked the committee for their acceptance of the task at hand.
- E. Linda Spohm – Ms. Spohm explained why she believes the material in the book is dangerous for youth.
- F. Mary Ravetta – Ms. Ravetta thanked the committee for being willing to read the material in the challenged books. Explained why she believed this material is harmful.
- G. Mark Spohm – Mr. Spohm thanked the committee for their acceptance of the task at hand.

VIII. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

A. Materials Submitted for Reconsideration

1. Identical; Ellen Hopkins ISBN 978-1416950059
 - 2 votes to reshelve to the adult section (Hillman, Denison)
 - 5 votes to remove the book from the libraries (Scott, Dempsey, Bertels, Malone, Pollen)

IX. NEW BUSINESS

A. Materials Submitted for Reconsideration

1. Red Hood; Elana K. Arnold ISBN 978-0062742353
 - Ms. Hillman moved to review Red Hood, unanimous consent.
2. Damsel; Elana K. Arnold ISBN 978-0-06-274232-2
3. Forever; Judy Blume ISBN 978-1-4814-1442-5
4. The Haters; Jesse Andrews ISBN 978-1-4197-2018-9
 - All other titles are postponed to the next meeting, unanimous consent.

- B. Decide if there should be limits imposed on the debate of questioned items during the meeting.
 1. No discussion.

X. NEXT MEETING

- A. September 9, 2024 – Ms. Denison moved to accept meeting date, unanimous consent.
- B. November was cancelled due to a scheduling conflict; other meetings are planned for second Mondays of each month going forward.

XI. MEMBERS, STAFF COMMENTS

- A. Mr. Leslie let the committee know we will collect the copies of Identical that were provided and score cards at the end of the meeting.
- B. Ms. Pollen was appreciative for being able to be involved in this process.
- C. Mr. Scott thanked everyone for their involvement. Reiterated that this committee is not a decision-making body, just advisory.
- D. Ms. Dempsey thanked everyone for the opportunity to participate.
- E. Ms. Denison asked for state law clarification.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

- A. Adjourned 5:59 pm

DRAFT



Matanuska-Susitna Borough

Community Development Department

Library Material Staff Report

Title: Red Hood

Author: Elana K. Arnold

Libraries where this material is shelved: Willow

Is the material in good condition or appearance?

Willow Library Material Condition – Good condition

Is the topic of the material a priority for the collection?

Red Hood is shelved in the Young Adult (YA) sections at Willow Library. Young Adult collections are responsive and tend to reflect the age and stage of life of the intended reader. The book, Red Hood, is a twist on a classic fairy tale to address the issues of sexual abuse and harassment among women.

Is the format of the material a priority for the collection?

The material is a book format. Books make up the majority of inventory in all five of our public libraries.

Has the material been used frequently by patrons?

This factor depends on the library due to the collections size, the size of the library and length of time one patron maintains the book. Willow Library shelved the book in June 2020 and the book has been checked out 12 times. This is about a medium rate of check out for the YA collection in a library of Willow's size.

Is the material factually accurate?

This book is a work of fiction and not a resource material.

Has the material been superseded by a new edition or a better source?

N/A

Is the material relevant to the needs and interests of the community?

The University of Alaska Anchorage publishes an Alaska Victimization Survey and reports that 33.7% of Mat-Su women experience sexual violence in their lifetime.

Can the material be easily borrowed from another source?

It is available at all the Borough libraries through our participation in the State Library Catalog as well as an E-Book through the Alaska Digital Library.

What is the literary, artistic, scientific, political, or educational merit of the material.

This Young Adult book addresses the difficult issues of sexual violence and harassment from a minor’s perspective with a female protagonist.

Does the material have positive review(s) in one or more appropriate professional journals?

Reviews are typically done in professional journals soon after the publication of the book. Staff could not find a record of a review in a professional journal without having to have a subscription to the journal.

Does the material have positive reviews from critics, patrons or staff members?

Source	Editor Rating	User Rating	# of reviews	Notes
Amazon		4.2 stars	185	
Barnes & Noble		3.8 stars	4	
Common Sense Media	4 stars		4	Suggested 15+
Goodreads		3.46 stars	958	
Kirkus				<i>“A timely and unabashedly feminist twist on a classic fairy tale.”</i>

Are there sufficient materials available on the same subject?

There are many nonfiction books and resources available on the subjects of sexual abuse and harassment.

Does the material have a reputation and/or significance of the author, publisher or producer?

Nine of Arnold’s books are Junior Library Guild selections; *A Boy called Bat*, *Bat and the Waiting Game*, *Damsel*, *Bat at the End of Everything*, *The House That Wasn’t There*, *Red Hood*, *Starla Jean* and *Just Harriet*. In 2021, Publishers Weekly named *Red Hood* as one of the top ten young adult novels of the year

Has the Mat-Su Borough School District’s (MSBSD) Library Citizen’s Advisory Committee (LCAC) reviewed this material?

Yes, the MSBSD LCAC reviewed the book on April 11, 2024 and recommended the book be removed from the school library system. The totals for the vote included:

- Retain at all libraries: 0
- Retain only at high school libraries: 4
- Retain only at middle and high school libraries: 0
- Remove from all school libraries: 6
- Vote Pending: 1

The MSBSD Board voted to remand the book to the Administration for a decision. The Administration determined that the book “Red Hood” would return to high school libraries.



Matanuska-Susitna Borough
Community Development Department
Library Material Review Score Card

Title:

Author:

Date:

Reviewer Name:

Evaluation criteria: *The committee should consider the following acquisition and weeding criteria as applied to the challenged material.*

- Is the material in good condition or appearance?
- Is the topic of the material a priority for the collection?
- Is the format of the material a priority for the collection?
- Has the material been used frequently by patrons?
- Is the material factually accurate?
- Has the material been superseded by a new edition or a better source?
- Is the material relevant to the needs and interests of the community?
- Can the material be easily borrowed from another source?
- Does the material have literary, artistic, scientific, political, or educational merit?

- Does the material have positive review(s) in one or more appropriate professional journals?
- Does the material have positive reviews from critics, patrons or staff members?
- Are there sufficient materials available on the same subject?
- Does the material have reputation and/or significance of the author, publisher or producer?

Suitability for Minors under 16 (answer yes or no):

1. Does the material depict the following actual or simulated conduct?

- sexual penetration;
- the lewd touching of a person's genitals, anus, or female breast;
- masturbation;
- bestiality;
- the lewd exhibition of a person's genitals, anus, or female breast; or
- sexual masochism or sadism

Yes No

2. Would the average individual, applying contemporary community standards, find that the material, *taken as a whole*, appeals to the prurient interest in sex for persons under 16 years of age?

Yes No

3. Would a reasonable person find that the material, *taken as a whole*, lacks serious literary, artistic, educational, political, or scientific value for persons under 16 years of age?

(Note: Mark "Yes" only if the book lacks all of them)

Yes No

4. Does the material depict actual or simulated conduct in a way that is patently offensive to the prevailing standards in the adult community as a whole with respect to what is suitable for persons under 16 years of age?

Yes No

COMMENTS (this may include anything related to the challenge or notes about factors contained in the above evaluation and suitability criteria):

SUGGESTED DISPOSITION:

- Keep the book where it is
- Reshelve the book to the young adult section
- Reshelve the book to the adult section
- Remove the book from the library
- Other _____

COMMENTS/REASONS REGARDING SUGGESTED DISPOSITION (if any):